

1. Gohiriwyd/Deferred

#	Cyfeirnod y Cais / Application Reference	Dyddiad y derbyniwyd / Received Date	Ymgeisydd / Applicant	Bwriad / Proposal	Lleoliad / Location	Argymhelliad / Recommendation
1	A220763	10-10-2022	Mr M Evans	Proposed replacement dwelling (Demolition at completion), extension to the garden area and associated works.	Allt y Bryn, Beulah, Newcastle Emlyn, SA38 9QH	Refuse

1.1. A220763



Rhif y Cais / Application Reference	A220763
Derbyniwyd / Received	10-10-2022
Y Bwriad / Proposal	Annedd newydd arfaethedig (gan ddymchwel yr annedd presennol wrth ei gwblhau), estyniad i ardal yr ardd a gwaith cysylltiedig.
Lleoliad Safle / Site Location	Allt y Bryn, Beulah, Castellnewydd Emlyn, SA38 9QH
Math o Gais / Application Type	Cynllunio llawn
Ymgeisydd / Applicant	Mr M Evans, Allt y Bryn, Beulah, Castell Newydd Emlyn, Ceredigion, SA38 9QH
Asiant / Agent	Mr Robert Thomas (Thomas Login Architecture), Plas y Berllan, Ffostrasol, Llandysul, Ceredigion, SA44 4TE

Y SAFLE A HANES PERTHNASOL

Saif Allt y Bryn, byngalo sengl, ar ochr ogleddol ffordd wledig wedi'i leoli 4.1 cilometr o Beulah, Castellnewydd Emlyn i'r de a 4.5 cilometr o Dan-y-groes i'r gorllewin. Mae'r byngalo sengl presennol yn wynebu'r de-orllewin ac mae ganddo bedair ystafell wely ac mae wedi'i adeiladu o waliau bloc sydd wedi'u rendro a'u paentio a chanddo do teils ar oledf. Mae gan y byngalo ddrwsau a ffenestri â fframiau uPVC.

Mae'r safle ehangach yn gweithredu menter gweithgynhyrchu ceir o'r enw Wales Motorsport. Mae siediau, rhandir ac ardal goetir sy'n rhan o'r safle.

Hanes cynllunio :

800128 - Estyniad i greu fflat hunangynhwysol i'r henoed - Cymeradwywyd gydag amodau 18/3/1980

A040011 - Amrywio amodau parthed: deiliadaeth (D2472 amod 10 a D2799 amod 2) - Cymeradwywyd gydag amodau 16/5/2004

A040012 - Codi gweithdy diwydiannol at ddefnydd busnes - Cymeradwywyd gydag amodau 4/7/2004

A150261 - Codi estyniad i'r gweithdy presennol - Cymeradwywyd gydag amodau 19/11/2015

A150338 - Dileu amod 2 o ganiatâd cynllunio A040011 – Cymeradwywyd 13/9/2015

A210137 – Sied storio arfaethedig – Cymeradwywyd gydag amodau 6/4/2021

MANYLION Y DATBLYGIAD

Ceisir caniatâd cynllunio llawn i ddymchwel yr annedd bresennol ac adeiladu annedd newydd gyda'r holl waith cysylltiedig arall.

Mae gan yr annedd bresennol ôl troed o 170 metr sgwâr ac mae cyfanswm ei lled tua 19m, cyfanswm ei dyfnder tua 15m a chyfanswm ei uchder tua 5.7m.

Yn fewnol, mae'r annedd bresennol yn cynnwys 4 ystafell wely, heulfan, ystafell esgidiau, en-suite, lolfa, ystafell fwyta a chegin gydag ystafell amlwrpas a storfa.

Byddai'r annedd arfaethedig yn cynnwys ôl troed o 253 metr sgwâr ac yn mesur 22m o led x dyfnder uchaf o 15.6m gydag uchder crib uchaf o 8.7m gyda dau uchder crib o 7.8m i ochr ddwyreiniol y brif wedd flaen a 6.2m i'r ochr orllewinol. Nid yw'r annedd arfaethedig wedi'i lleoli ar ôl troed yr annedd bresennol; mae'r cynnig yn gofyn i'r annedd bresennol gael ei chadw fel preswylfa nes bod yr annedd newydd wedi'i chwblhau.

Yn fewnol, byddai'r annedd arfaethedig yn cynnwys ystafell gyda'r nos, lolfa, pantri 2 doiled, cyntedd, ystafell gotiau, ystafell gawod, ystafell amlwrpas, cegin ac ardal fwyta, ystafell gypyrddau a swyddfa ar gyfer Wales Motorsports ar lefel y llawr gwaelod, tra ar lefel y llawr cyntaf byddai'r annedd arfaethedig yn cynnwys 4 ystafell wely, 2 en-suite, ardal wisgo, balconi a 2 fod ar gyfer en-suites / ystafelloedd gwisgo dewisol.

Byddai'r annedd newydd yn cynnwys rendr wedi'i baentio, gan gynnwys gwaith cerrig a nodwedd â chladin pren ar waliau allanol, teils to llechi naturiol a ffenestri a drysau UPVC ac alwminiwm cyfansawdd.

Bydd carthion budr yn cael eu gwaredu trwy gyfleuster parod i drin carthion newydd a bydd dŵr wyneb yn cael ei waredu trwy suddfannau dŵr.

POLISIŌAU A CHANLLAWIAU CYNLLUNIO PERTHNASOL

Mae'r polisiâu canlynol o'r Cynllun Datblygu Lleol yn berthnasol wrth benderfynu'r cais hwn: / These Local Development Plan policies are applicable in the determination of this application:

DM06 Dylunio a Chreu Lle o Safon Uchel

DM13 Systemau Draenio Cynaliadwy

DM14 Cadwraeth Natur a Chysylltedd Ecolegol

DM15 Cadw Bioamrywiaeth Leol

DM17 Y Dirwedd yn Gyffredinol

LU02 Gofynion sy'n ymwneud â phob Datblygiad Preswyl

LU08 Anheddau Newydd yn Lle'r Rhai Presennol

Polisi S01 Twf Cynaliadwy

Polisi S04: Datblygu mewn Aneddiadau Cyswllt a Lleoliadau Eraill

Mae'r dogfennau Canllaw Cynllunio Atodol canlynol yn berthnasol:

Amgylchedd Adeiledig a Dylunio

Canllawiau Cynllunio Atodol Cadwraeth Natur

YSTYRIAETHAU PERTHNASOL ERAILL

DEDDF TROSEDD AC ANHREFN 1998

Mae adran 17(1) o Ddeddf Trosedd ac Anhrefn 1998 yn gosod dyletswydd ar yr Awdurdod Lleol i arfer ei swyddogaethau amrywiol gan roi sylw dyledus i effaith debygol arfer y swyddogaethau hynny ar droseddau ac anhrefn yn ei ardal, a'r angen i wneud popeth y gall yn rhesymol i atal hynny. Mae'r ddyletswydd hon wedi'i hystyried wrth werthuso'r cais hwn. Ystyrir na fyddai cynnydd sylweddol nac annerbyniol mewn trosedd ac anhrefn o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad arfaethedig.

DEDDF CYDRADDOLDEB 2010

Mae Deddf Cydraddoldeb 2010 yn nodi nifer o 'nodweddion gwarchoddedig', sef oedran; anabledd; aillbennu rhywedd; beichiogrwydd a mamolaeth; hil; crefydd neu gred; rhyw; cyfeiriadedd rhywiol; priodas a phartneriaeth sifil. Mae rhoi sylw dyledus i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb yn cynnwys:

- dileu neu leihau anfanteision a ddioddefir gan bobl oherwydd eu nodweddion gwarchoddedig;
- cymryd camau i ddiwallu anghenion pobl o grwpiau gwarchoddedig pan fo'r rhain yn wahanol i anghenion pobl eraill; ac
- annog pobl sydd mewn grwpiau gwarchoddedig i gymryd rhan mewn bywyd cyhoeddus neu mewn gweithgareddau eraill lle mae niferoedd anghymesur o isel o'u plith yn cymryd rhan.

Rhodddwyd ystyriaeth ddyledus i'r ddyletswydd uchod wrth benderfynu ar y cais hwn. Ystyrir nad oes gan y datblygiad arfaethedig unrhyw oblygiadau sylweddol ar gyfer personau sy'n rhannu nodwedd warchoddedig, nac ydyw'n cael effaith arnynt, yn fwy nag unrhyw berson arall.

DEDDF LLESIANT CENEDLAETHAU'R DYFODOL (CYMRU) 2015

Mae Deddf Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru) 2015 yn gosod dyletswydd ar y Cyngor i gymryd camau rhesymol wrth arfer ei swyddogaethau i gyflawni saith nod llesiant y Ddeddf. Paratowyd yr adroddiad hwn i ystyried dyletswydd y Cyngor a'r 'egwyddor datblygu cynaliadwy', fel y'i nodir yn Neddf 2015. Wrth gyrraedd yr argymhelliad, mae'r Cyngor wedi ceisio sicrhau bod anghenion y presennol yn cael eu diwallu heb gyfaddawdu ar allu cenedlaethau'r dyfodol i ddiwallu eu hanghenion eu hunain.

YMATEBION YMGYNGHORI

Cyngor Cymuned Beulah - yn cefnogi'r cais hwn, ar y sail bod y byngalo presennol yn fach iawn a bod safon y tŷ yn wael. Mae angen mwy o le ar y teulu, a bydd hefyd yn codi safon y tŷ presennol. Mae'r safle'n ddelfrydol gan fod y gweithle teuluol ar yr un safle.

Priffyrdd - Bydd unrhyw ganiatâd y gall yr Awdurdod Cynllunio ei roi yn cynnwys Amod sy'n ymwneud â dŵr wyneb..

Draenio Tir – Argymell gosod arwyneb newydd, gan gynyddu suddfannau dŵr wyneb ffo ac mae angen cymeradwyaeth Systemau Draenio Cynaliadwy.

Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru – does dim gwrthwynebiad i'r datblygiad arfaethedig ac maent yn cynnig cyngor mewn perthynas â safleoedd gwarchoddedig a rhywogaethau a warchodir yn Ewrop.

Ecoleg – Dim gwrthwynebiadau

CASGLIAD

Mae adran 38(6) o Ddeddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 yn nodi os oes angen rhoi sylw i'r cynllun datblygu at ddiben unrhyw benderfyniad sydd i'w wneud o dan y Deddfau cynllunio rhaid i'r penderfyniad fod yn unol â'r cynllun oni bai bod ystyriaeth berthnasol yn nodi fel arall.

Egwyddor datblygu

Mae'r cynnig wedi'i gyflwyno'n llawn gyda'r dymuniad i ddymchwel yr adeilad un llawr a chodi annedd ddeulawr newydd wedi'i lleoli ger yr annedd bresennol o dan bolisi LU08 y CDLI. Mae Polisi LU08 yn cefnogi cynigion ar gyfer anheddau newydd ar yr amod bod yr annedd newydd wedi'i lleoli o fewn neu gerllaw ôl troed yr annedd wreiddiol ac yn adlewyrchu ffurf, swmp, maint a graddfa'r annedd wreiddiol ac yn parchu neu'n gwella dyluniad yr annedd wreiddiol, eiddo cyfagos a'r gymdogaeth.

Mae'r annedd arfaethedig wedi'i lleoli wrth ymyl y tŷ annedd gwreiddiol gydag ôl troed mwy. Ni fydd y tŷ presennol yn cael ei ddymchwel tan i'r annedd newydd gael ei chwblhau; yn unol â'r meini prawf asesu mae hyn yn dderbyniol gan y bydd y gwaith dymchwel yn cael ei wneud o fewn cyfnod amser derbyniol. Wrth edrych ar olygfa'r stryd, nodir bod yr ardal gyfagos yn darlunio cefn gwlad gyda chaeau agored, adeiladau amaethyddol ac anheddau ysbeidiol. Mae'r annedd agosaf wedi'i lleoli 128m i'r gorllewin o'r safle ac mae'n adlewyrchu annedd ddeulawr gyda tho talcen. Deuir i'r casgliad, o ystyried cyd-destun yr olygfa stryd bresennol, fod dyluniad, maint a graddfa'r annedd arfaethedig yn cael ei ystyried yn amhriodol ar gyfer y cyd-destun gwledig iawn.

Mae'r annedd newydd arfaethedig yn cynyddu gofod byw safle'r cais ac mae'r mäs a'r swmp yn cynyddu i dŷ annedd deulawr. Byddai'r adeilad arfaethedig ag uchder o 8.4m sydd 3.5m yn uwch na'r annedd bresennol a lled o 22.8m sydd 4.3m yn lletach na'r annedd bresennol, dau do ar oleddf ar y wedd flaen gyda mwy o ffenestri o'i gymharu â'r tŷ presennol.

Mae'r safle wedi'i lleoli mewn "Lleoliad Arall" at ddibenion y Cynllun Datblygu Lleol ac o'r herwydd, rhaid rheoli'r datblygiad yn llym. Mae Polisi LU08: Anheddau Newydd yn Lle'r Rhai Presennol yn berthnasol a rhaid i'r annedd newydd fodloni nifer o feini prawf, a drafodir isod:

Yn ôl y datganiad cynllunio, mae yna bobl yn byw yn yr annedd bresennol ar hyn o bryd ac mae'n adnabyddadwy fel annedd Dosbarth C3 barhaol. Felly, mae Maen Prawf 1 wedi'i fodloni.

O ran Maen Prawf 2i: dylai'r annedd newydd gael ei lleoli o fewn neu wrth ymyl ôl troed yr annedd wreiddiol ac adlewyrchu ffurf, swmp, maint a graddfa'r annedd wreiddiol onid oes manteision cynllunio amlwg o newid cyfeiriadedd, safle neu faint yr un wreiddiol.

Byddai'r annedd newydd wedi'i lleoli wrth ymyl ôl troed yr annedd wreiddiol; fodd bynnag, bydd y ffurf, swmp, maint a graddfa yn fwy ac felly ni fyddai'n adlewyrchu'r annedd wreiddiol. Felly nid yw Maen Prawf 2i wedi'i fodloni'n llawn.

Mae Maen Prawf 2ii yn nodi y dylai'r annedd newydd barchu neu wella dyluniad yr annedd wreiddiol, eiddo cyfagos a'r gymdogaeth.

Mae ymddangosiad yr annedd newydd yn sylweddol wahanol ac yn cyflwyno ffenestri mawr ar y wedd flaen, llawr ychwanegol, a tho sy'n disodli tŷ annedd un llawr syml. Er bod yr eiddo yn gymharol ynysig ac wedi'i rwystro'n rhannol o olwg y cyhoedd, serch hynny nid yw'n parchu arddull bensaernïol yr annedd bresennol ac felly nid yw Maen Prawf 2ii wedi'i fodloni.

Mae Maen Prawf 3 yn nodi y bydd y datblygiad arfaethedig yn amodol ar ddymchwel yr annedd wreiddiol ar yr adeg briodol. Bydd yr annedd bresennol yn cael ei ddymchwel cyn i'r annedd newydd gael ei meddiannu gyntaf. Yn hyn o beth, mae'n

cwrdd â Maen Prawf 3.

I grynhoi, er bod yr annedd newydd yn cyd-fynd â Meini Prawf 1 a 3 Polisi LU08, nid yw'r cynnig yn bodloni Maen Prawf 2i a 2ii. Felly, ni dderbynnir yr egwyddor o annedd newydd yn lle'r un presennol yn y lleoliad hwn neu gyda'r dyluniad hwn.

Amwynder

Mae Maen Prawf 7 Polisi DM06 yn ceisio diogelu amwynderau deiliaid eiddo cyfagos rhag niwed sylweddol o safbwynt preifatrwydd, sŵn a golygon. Mae'r tŷ presennol i'w weld o'r brif ffordd a byddai'r annedd newydd hefyd gan nad oes tirwedd wedi'i gynnig ar hyd blaen yr eiddo. Bydd lleoliad yr annedd newydd wedi'i leoli 128m o unrhyw gymydog cyfagos i'r gorllewin o'r safle, a thrwy hynny mae ei ymyrraeth swyddogaethol a gweledol yn gyfyngedig. Er mwyn cuddio rhagor ar yr annedd arfaethedig o'r brif ffordd, mae amod yn ymwneud â thirwedd yn angenrheidiol; bydd cynllun tirwedd yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r manylion cymeradwy (Drwg Rhif 2214-PS a dderbyniwyd 26/10/2022) a bydd yr holl blannu'n cael ei gyflawni o fewn 12 mis calendr o ddechrau'r datblygiad, er mwyn diogelu cymeriad ac amwynderau'r ardal a sicrhau bod y plannu y cytunwyd arno'n cael ei wneud o fewn cyfnod rhesymol. Yn hyn o beth, mae'r cynnig yn bodloni Polisi DM06.

Dylunio

Mae Polisi DM06 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ddatblygiad roi sylw llawn a chyfrannu'n gadarnhaol at gyd-destun ei leoliad a'i amgylchedd. Mae'n hyrwyddo dylunio arloesol ac yn rhoi sylw i hynodrwydd lleol o ran ffurf, dyluniad a defnyddiau ac mae angen ystyried cydnawsedd y ffurf adeiledig o ran graddfa, uchder a chyfran mewn perthynas â phatrymau'r cynllun presennol. Yn ogystal, mae Polisi DM17 yn nodi na ddylai datblygiad gael effaith andwyol sylweddol ar ansawdd a chymeriad tirwedd, boed trwy ymyrraeth weledol, lleoliad anystyriol, defnyddiau anghydawns, methiant i gysoni neu wella tiffurf, neu golli nodweddion a phatrymau traddodiadol pwysig.

Mae'r arddull bensaernïol yn amlwg yn wahanol iawn i un yr annedd bresennol, ac felly nid yw'n bodloni Maen Prawf 2ii Polisi LU08. Mae'r uchder a'r swmp yn ormodol ac felly'n anystyriol i leoliad fferm wledig y safle. Byddai'r annedd newydd i'w weld yn amlwg ar y brif ffordd heb unrhyw dirwedd arfaethedig i liniaru ei heffaith. Ar ben hynny, mae'r steil anghyson o ran dyluniad a phatrwm y ffenestri yn yr annedd drwyddi draw yn ei gwneud yn anghyson â Pholisïau DM06 a DM17.

Mae trafodaethau wedi cael eu cynnal gyda'r Awdurdod Cynllunio Lleol ond mae'r ymgeisydd wedi penderfynu yn erbyn cyflwyno unrhyw gynlluniau diwygiedig ac wedi gofyn i'r cais gael ei benderfynu fel ag y mae.

Ecoleg

Cyflwynwyd Arolwg Ystlumod i'w ystyried sy'n cadarnhau bod yr annedd mewn cynefin sy'n ffafriol i ystlumod. Fodd bynnag, canfu'r arolwg nad oedd unrhyw arwyddion o ystlumod yn defnyddio'r annedd ac ystyrir nad oes gan yr eiddo lawer o botensial i gynnal ystlumod. Cadarnhaodd yr arolwg gweithgarwch ganlyniad dim ystlumod yr arolwg cwmpasu, gan ganfod nad oedd unrhyw ystlumod yn defnyddio'r adeilad.

Nid oedd unrhyw adar yn nythu na gweithgarwch tylluanod. Mae'r adran ecoleg wedi gwneud sawl argymhelliad. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys, cyn i'r gwaith ddechrau, gosod 2 x bocs ystlumod Harlech Woodstone (neu debyg) ar goed aeddfed o fewn cwrtill yr eiddo. 1 x bocs ystlumod Beaumaris Woodstone (neu debyg) i'w osod i wedd dde-ddwyrain yr annedd newydd. 1 x cwpan nyth Gwennol y Bondo i'w osod i wedd ogledd-orllewin yr annedd newydd ac yn olaf gellid sicrhau budd ecolegol ehangach trwy sicrhau (lle bo modd) bod pob ffin yn cael ei phlannu â rhywogaethau brodorol i gadw cysylltedd â'r cynefin cyfagos yn ogystal â chadw (lle bo hynny'n bosibl a pherthnasol) unrhyw goed aeddfed ar y safle. Ni ddylai fod unrhyw golled net o wrychoedd.

Nid oes unrhyw oleuadau allanol wedi'u manylu ar y cynlluniau, ond pe bai goleuadau allanol yn cael eu gosod, yna bydd angen ystyried yn ofalus unrhyw oleuadau allanol ar y datblygiad arfaethedig, bydd angen nodi mesurau i leihau'r effeithiau ar gymudo a chwilota gan fywyd gwylt y nos yn yr ardal leol, yn enwedig nodweddion sy'n debygol o fod o arwyddocâd i weithgareddau chwilota a chymudo yn y nos h.y. gwrychoedd a glannau afonydd.

Mae'r cynnig wedi cael ei sgrinio fel un nad yw'n debygol o gael effaith sylweddol ar Afon Teifi drwy gynydd mewn ffosffadau yn unol â "Chyngor" Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru (Fersiwn 3 Gorffennaf 2022).

ARGYMHELLIAD:

GWRTHOD

Mae'r rhesymau fel a ganlyn:

1. Yn rhinwedd ei ffurf, swmp, maint a graddfa, ni fyddai'r annedd newydd yn adlewyrchu nodweddion yr annedd wreiddiol. Nid oes unrhyw fanteision cynllunio amlwg wedi'u dangos ac felly nid yw'r cynnig yn cydymffurfio â Maen Prawf 2i o bolisi LU08.

2. Oherwydd ei huchder, ei swmp a'i dyluniad cyffredinol, ystyrir bod yr annedd newydd arfaethedig yn ormod ac yn methu â pharchu lleoliad fferm wledig y safle. Mae'r ffenestri arfaethedig yn anghyson o ran dyluniad a phatrwm ac yn gyffredinol nid yw'r cynnig yn cyd-fynd â Pholisïau DM06 a DM17.

RHESYMAU DROS GYFEIRIO'R MATER AT SYLW'R PWYLLGOR RHEOLI DATBLYGU:

Nid yw'r Aelod Lleol yn cytuno gyda'r farn nad yw'r dyluniad yn cydweddu gyda'r stoc tai lleol. Mae'n dymuno i'r pwyllgor cynllunio cael y cyfle i'w weld yn fanwl a gwneud penderfyniad gwybodus.

Panel Archwilio Safle

Penderfynodd Aelodau'r Pwyllgor Rheoli Datblygu, yn ei avarfod ar 12 Gorffennaf 2023, gyfeirio'r cais at y Panel Archwilio Safle i'w ystyried yn unol â Pharagraff 2 o feini prawf mabwysiedig y Cyngor.

Cyfarfu'r Panel Archwilio Safle ddydd Llun 31 Gorffennaf 2023 ac roedd yn cynnwys y Cynghorydd Ifan Davies (Is-gadeirydd), y Cynghorydd Rhodri Evans, y Cynghorydd Gareth Lloyd, y Cynghorydd Gethin Davies, a'r Cynghorydd Marc Davies. Hefyd yn bresennol roedd y Cynghorydd Chris James a'r Cynghorydd Amanda Edwards fel aelodau lleol, a Mrs Sian Holder, Arweinydd Tîm Rheoli Datblygu'r De.

Cyflwynodd Mrs Holder y cais a'r prif resymau pam fod yr ACLI yn arqymell gwrthod y cais, sy'n seiliedig ar raddfa a dyluniad yr annedd newydd, ac felly nid yw'n cydymffurfio â Pholisïau LU08, DM06 a DM17 y Cynllun Datblygu Lleol.

Bu'r Panel yn archwilio'r tir y tu ôl i'r annedd bresennol, lle bwriedir lleoli'r annedd newydd. Cafwyd trafodaethau ar raddfa'r bynaalo presennol a chymharwyd ei ôl troed ag ôl troed yr annedd newydd. Nodwyd nad oedd yr adeilad presennol o unrhyw werth pensaernïol ac y byddai'r annedd newydd yn fwy vnni-effeithlon. Nodwyd cvd-destun y safle hefyd mewn perthynas â'r siediau presennol, y byddai'r annedd newydd mewn llinell â nhw fwy neu lai, a hefyd bod y safle yn sefyll ar ei ben ei hun heb unrhyw dai cyfagos. Nodwyd nad oedd arddull bensaernïol benodol yn yr ardal.

Bu'r Panel hefyd yn archwilio'r safle o'r tu blaen gan nodi y byddai'r annedd newydd yn cael ei gosod ymhellach yn ôl ac nad oedd modd ei gweld yn syth o'r ffordd wrth basio.

Daeth yr Is-gadeirydd â'r cyfarfod i ben.

Rhif y Cais / Application Reference	A220763
Derbyniwyd / Received	10-10-2022
Y Bwriad / Proposal	Proposed replacement dwelling (Demolition at completion), extension to the garden area and associated works.
Lleoliad Safle / Site Location	Allt y Bryn, Beulah, Newcastle Emlyn, SA38 9QH
Math o Gais / Application Type	Full Planning
Ymgeisydd / Applicant	Mr M Evans, Allt Y Bryn, Beulah, Newcastle Emlyn, Ceredigion, SA38 9QH
Asiant / Agent	Mr Robert Thomas (Thomas Login Architecture), Plas Y Berllan, Ffostrasol, Llandysul, Ceredigion, SA44 4TE

THE SITE AND RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

Allt y Bryn comprises a detached bungalow situated to the northern side of a country road located 4.1km from Beulah, Newcastle Emlyn to the south and 4.5km from Tan-y-groes to the west. The existing detached bungalow is south west facing and has four bedrooms and is constructed of block walls that have been rendered and painted with a pitched tiled roof. The bungalow has uPVC framed windows and doors.

The wider site operates car manufacturing enterprise known as Wales Motorsport, there are sheds, an allotment and a woodland area that form part of the site.

Planning history:

800128 - Extension to form self-contained flat for the elderly - Approved STC 18/3/1980

A040011 - Variation of conditions re: occupancy (D2472 condition 10 & D2799 condition 2) - Approved STC 16/5/2004

A040012 - Erection of an industrial workshop for business use - Approved STC 4/7/2004

A150261 - Erection of extension to existing workshop - Approved STC 19/11/2015

A150338 - Removal of condition 2 of planning permission A040011 – Approved 13/9/2015

A210137 – Proposed storage shed – Approved STC 6/4/2021

DETAILS OF DEVELOPMENT

Full planning permission is sought to demolish the existing dwelling and construct a replacement dwelling with all other associated works.

The existing dwelling has a footprint of 170sqm and includes a total width of approximately 19m, total depth of approximately 15m and total height of approximately 5.7m.

Internally, the existing dwelling includes 4no bedrooms, conservatory, boot room, en-suite, lounge, dining and kitchen room with utility room and storage.

The proposed dwelling would feature a footprint of 253sqm and measure 22m wide x maximum depth of 15.6m with maximum ridge height of 8.7m with two set down ridge heights of 7.8m high to the eastern side of the principal front elevation and 6.2m to the western side. The proposed dwelling is not sited on the footprint of the existing dwelling, the proposal requests that the existing dwelling be kept for occupation until the new dwelling is built.

Internally, the proposed dwelling would include an evening room, lounge, larder, 2no W/C, porch, cloakroom, shower room, utility, kitchen and dining area, cupboard room and office for Wales Motorsports at ground floor level, while at first floor level the proposed dwelling would include 4no bedrooms, 2no en-suite, dressing area, balcony and 2no spaces for optional en-suites/ dressing rooms.

The replacement dwelling would feature painted render, including stonework and timber-clad feature to external walls, natural slate roof tiles and UPVC & aluminium composite windows and doors.

Foul sewage will be disposed of via a new package treatment plant and surface water will be disposed of via soakaways.

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICIES AND GUIDANCE

These Local Development Plan policies are applicable in the determination of this application:

DM06 High Quality Design and Placemaking

DM13 Sustainable Drainage Systems

DM14 Nature Conservation and Ecological Connectivity

DM15 Local Biodiversity Conservation

DM17 General Landscape

LU02 Requirements Regarding All Residential Developments

LU08 Replacement of Existing Dwellings

Policy S01 Sustainable Growth

Policy S04: Development within Linked Settlements and Other Locations

The following Supplementary Planning Guidance documents are applicable:

Built Environment and Design

Nature Conservation SPG

OTHER MATERIAL CONSIDERATIONS

CRIME AND DISORDER ACT 1998

Section 17(1) of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 imposes a duty on the Local Authority to exercise its various functions with due regard to the likely effect of the exercise of those functions on, and the need to do all that it reasonably can to prevent, crime and disorder in its area. This duty has been considered in the evaluation of this application. It is considered that there would be no significant or unacceptable increase in crime and disorder as a result of the proposed decision.

EQUALITY ACT 2010

The Equality Act 2010 identifies a number of 'protected characteristics', namely age; disability; gender reassignment; pregnancy and maternity; race; religion or belief; sex; sexual orientation; marriage and civil partnership. Having due regard to advancing equality involves:

- removing or minimising disadvantages suffered by people due to their protected characteristics;
- taking steps to meet the needs of people from protected groups where these differ from the need of other people; and
- encouraging people from protected groups to participate in public life or in other activities where their participation is disproportionately low.

The above duty has been given due consideration in the determination of this application. It is considered that the proposed development does not have any significant implications for, or effect on, persons who share a protected characteristic, over and above any other person.

WELL-BEING OF FUTURE GENERATIONS (WALES) ACT 2015

The Well-Being of Future Generations Act (Wales) 2015 places a duty on the Council to take reasonable steps in exercising its functions to meet the seven well-being goals within the Act. This report has been prepared in consideration of the

Council's duty and the 'sustainable development principle', as set out in the 2015 Act. In reaching the recommendation, the

Council has sought to ensure that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.

CONSULTATION RESPONSES

Beulah Community Council - supports this application, on the basis that the current bungalow is very small and that the standard of the house is poor. The family needs more space, and it will also rise the standard of the current house. The site

is ideal as the family workplace is on the same site.

Highways - Any permission which the Planning Authority may give shall include a Condition relating to surface water..

Land Drainage – Make recommendations new surfacing, increasing surface water run off, soakaways and SUDS approval is required.

Natural Resources Wales – have no objection to the proposed development and offer the advice in relation to protected sites and European protected species.

Ecology – No objections

CONCLUSION

Section 38 (6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 states that: “If regard is to be had to the development plan for the purpose of any determination to be made under the planning Acts the determination must be in accordance with the plan unless material consideration indicates otherwise”.

Principle of development

The proposal has been submitted in full and seeks to demolish the single storey building and erect a new two storey dwelling located adjacent to the existing dwelling under policy LU08 of the LDP. Policy LU08 supports proposals for replacement dwellings provided that the new dwelling be located within or adjacent to the footprint of the original dwelling and reflect the form, bulk, size and scale of the original dwelling and respect or enhance the design of the original dwelling, that of surrounding properties and the locality.

The proposed dwelling is located adjacent to the original dwellinghouse with a larger footprint. The existing house will not be demolished until the completion of the new dwelling, as per the assessment criteria this is acceptable as the demolition will be done within an acceptable time period. Looking to the street scene, it is noted that the surrounding area depicts the countryside with open fields, agricultural buildings and sporadic dwellings. The nearest dwelling is located 128m to the west of the site and reflects a two-storey dwelling with a gabled roof form. It would be concluded that given the context of the existing street scene that the design, size and scale of the proposed dwelling is considered inappropriate for the very rural context.

The proposed replacement dwelling increases the living space of the application site and the mass and bulk increases to a two storey dwellinghouse. The proposed dwelling would feature an increased height of 8.4m which is 3.5m higher than the existing dwelling and width of 22.8m which is 4.3m wider than the existing dwelling, mirrored pitched roof on the front elevation with an increased fenestration when compared to the existing house.

The site is located within an “Other Location” for the purposes of the Local Development Plan and as such, development must be strictly controlled. Policy LU08: Replacement of Existing Dwellings is relevant and the replacement dwelling must meet various criteria, which are discussed below:

According to the planning statement, the existing dwelling is currently occupied and is recognisable as a permanent Class C3 dwelling. Criterion 1 is therefore satisfied.

In respect of Criterion 2i: the replacement dwelling should be located within or adjacent to the footprint of the original dwelling and reflect the form, bulk, size and scale of the original dwelling unless there are demonstrable planning advantages to be gained from deviating from the original orientation, position or size.

The replacement dwelling would be located adjacent to the footprint of the original dwelling, however the form, bulk, size and scale will be larger and therefore would not reflect the original dwelling. Criterion 2i has therefore not been fully met.

Criterion 2ii states that the replacement dwelling should respect or enhance the design of the original dwelling, that of surrounding property and the locality.

The appearance of the replacement dwelling is significantly different and introduces large fenestration on the front elevation, an increased storey, and a roof which replaces a simple single storey dwellinghouse. Although the property is relatively isolated and somewhat obstructed from public view, it nevertheless does not respect the architectural style of the existing dwelling and therefore Criterion 2ii has not been met.

Criterion 3 states that the proposed development will be subject to the demolition of the original dwelling at the appropriate time. The existing dwelling will be demolished prior to the first occupation of the new dwelling. In this regard, it meets Criterion 3.

In summary, while the replacement dwelling accords with Criterion 1 and 3 of Policy LU08, the proposal does not meet

Criterion 2i and 2ii. The principle of a replacement dwelling in this location or design is therefore not accepted.

Amenity

Criterion 7 of Policy DM06 seeks to protect the amenity of occupiers of nearby properties from significant harm in relation to privacy, noise and outlook. The existing house is visible from the main road and the replacement dwelling would be as well as there is no landscaping proposed along the front of the property. The location of the replacement dwelling will be located 128m from any adjacent neighbour to the west of the site, thereby limiting its functional and visual intrusion. To further shield the proposed dwelling from the main road, a condition relating to landscaping is necessary, a landscaping scheme shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details (Drwg No. 2214-PS received 26/10/2022) and all plantings shall be carried out within 12 calendar months of the commencement of the development, the reason is in order to safeguard the character and amenities of the area and to ensure that the agreed planting is carried out within a reasonable period. In this regard, the proposal satisfies Policy DM06.

Design

Policy DM06 requires development to have full regard and positively contribute to the context of its location and surroundings. It promotes innovative design whilst having regard for local distinctiveness in terms of form, design and material and requires consideration of the cohesiveness of the built form in terms of scale, height and proportion in reference to existing layout patterns. Additionally, Policy DM17 states that development should not have a significant adverse effect on the quality and character of a landscape, whether through visual intrusion, an insensitive siting, incompatible uses, failure to harmonise or enhance landform, or the loss of important traditional features and patterns.

The architectural style very clearly departs from that of the existing dwelling, and therefore does not satisfy Criterion 2ii of Policy LU08. The height and bulk is excessive and therefore insensitive to the site's rural farmstead setting. The new dwelling would appear visually prominent on the main road with no landscaping proposed to mitigate its impact.

Furthermore, the inconsistent stylization in terms of window design and pattern throughout the dwelling renders it inconsistent with Policies DM06 and DM17.

Discussions have taken place with the Local Planning Authority but the applicant has decided against submitting any revised plans and has asked for the application to be determined as it stands.

Ecology

A Bat Survey was submitted for consideration which confirms that the dwelling is in a favourable bat habitat. However, the survey found that there were no signs of bat use by the dwelling and the property is considered to have negligible potential to support bats. The activity survey confirmed the nil result of the scoping survey, with no bats found to be using the building.

There were no nesting birds or owl activity. The ecology department has made several recommendations. These include, prior to works commencing 2 x Harlech Woodstone (or similar) bat boxes to be affixed to mature trees within the curtilage of the property. 1 x Beaumaris Woodstone (or similar) bat box to be affixed to the south east elevation of the new dwelling. 1 x House martin nest cup to be affixed to the north west elevation of the new dwelling and lastly wider ecological benefit could be achieved by ensuring (where possible) all boundaries are planted with native species to retain connectivity to the surrounding habitat as well as retaining (where possible and relevant) any mature trees on site. There should be no net loss of hedgerow.

No external lighting has been detailed on the plans, but should external lighting be installed, then careful consideration will need to be given to any external lighting of the proposed development, measures will need to be identified to minimise impacts to nocturnal wildlife commuting and foraging in the local area, particularly features likely to be of importance to nocturnal foraging and commuting activities i.e. hedgerow and riverbanks.

The proposal has been screened out as not likely to have a significant effect on the Afon Teifi from increased phosphates in accordance with Natural Resources Wales "Advice (Version 3 July 2022).

RECOMMENDATION:

REFUSAL

Reasons are as follows:

1. By virtue of its form, bulk, size and scale the replacement dwelling would fail to reflect the characteristics of the original dwelling. No demonstrable planning advantages have been demonstrated and therefore the proposal fails to accord with Criterion 2i of policy LU08.

2. By reason of its height, bulk and overall design, the proposed replacement dwelling is considered excessive and fails to

respect the site's rural farmstead setting. The proposed fenestration is inconsistent in regard to design and pattern and overall the proposal fails to accord with Policies DM06 and DM17.

REASONS FOR REFERRAL TO THE DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE:

The Local Member does not agree with the opinion that the design is not in keeping with local housing stock. He wishes that the planning committee has the opportunity to view it in detail and make an informed decision.

Site Inspection Panel

Members of the Development Management Committee, at its meeting on 12 July 2023, resolved to refer the application to the Site Inspection Panel (SIP) for consideration in accordance with Paragraph 2 of the Council's adopted criteria.

The SIP met on Monday 31 July 2023 and comprised Cllr Ifan Davies (Vice Chair), Cllr Rhodri Evans, Cllr Gareth Lloyd, Cllr Gethin Davies, and Cllr Marc Davies. Also in attendance were Cllr Chris James and Cllr Amanda Edwards as local members, and Mrs Sian Holder, Development Management Team Leader South.

Mrs Holder introduced the application and the main reasons why the LPA are recommending that the application is refused, which is based on the scale and design of the replacement dwelling and thus its non-compliance with Policies LU08, DM06 and DM17 of the Local Development Plan.

The Panel inspected the land to the rear of the existing dwelling, where the replacement dwelling is proposed to be sited. Discussions were had on the scale of the existing bungalow and its comparison with the replacement dwelling in terms of its footprint. It was noted that the existing building was of no architectural merit and that the replacement dwelling would be more energy efficient. The context of the site was also noted with regards to the existing sheds, where the replacement dwelling would roughly be in line with, and also that the site stood in isolation with no nearby dwellings. It was noted that there was no specific architectural style in the locality.

The Panel also inspected the site from the front noting that the replacement dwelling would be set further back and that it was not immediately visible from the road when passing.

The Vice Chair consequently closed the meeting.